

-Meeting Summary-

February 18, 2011 - (9:00 a.m. – 10:30 a.m.)

1. Welcome

The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m., February 18, 2011, by the Chair of the Delta Independent Science Board (Delta ISB), Dr. Richard Norgaard. Eight members of the Delta Independent Science Board were present on the call for the meeting: Elizabeth Canuel, Tracy Collier, Edward Houde, Judy Meyer, Jeffrey Mount, Richard Norgaard, Vince Resh, and John Wiens. Brian Atwater and Michael Healey were absent from the teleconference.

Richard Norgaard welcomed participants. No new conflicts, or need for new disclosures had arisen for the Board.

Members of the Public in attendance:

Amy Richey (Mosaic Associates LLC in Pinole); Chuck Jenkins (Bureau of Indian Affairs); Robert Morrow (Arcadis); Valarie Connor (State and Federal Contractors Water Agency); Kurt Ohlinger (Sacramento Regional County Sanitation District); Ed Horton (Placer County Water Agency); and Valerie Kincaid (San Joaquin River Group Authority).

Delta Science Program Staff in attendance:

Marina Brand, Lauren Hastings, Cliff Dahm, and Gina Ford

2. Delta Stewardship Council Chair and Executive Officer Report

Phil Isenberg, Chair of the Delta Stewardship Council (Council), was not able to attend the meeting as previously arranged. Joe Grindstaff, Executive Officer of the Council was available and did attend for this agenda item.

Grindstaff provided a report to the Delta ISB regarding the February 14 release of the first staff draft of the Delta Plan, and other related information. Grindstaff explained that the key element in the February 14 draft was the Findings. He acknowledged that there was not a lot of supporting documentation for the various Findings contained in the first staff draft of the Delta Plan and as a result he also requested that the consultants prepare Fact Sheets that would provide the supporting information and citations for each Finding. Grindstaff noted that it would be critical for the Delta ISB to comment on the Fact Sheets. The Fact Sheets will be released to the public no later than February 24, 2011 – the first day of the Council's February public meeting.

Grindstaff said that he would ideally like to see comments from the Delta ISB on the Fact Sheets and the first staff draft of the Delta Plan by mid-March. When provided a copy of the schedule

that the Delta ISB had developed to prepare and submit comments, he indicated that it would be sufficient. The Delta ISB schedule is provided under item 4 of this summary.

Collier asked Grindstaff why a Water Quality chapter was not included in the first staff draft of the Delta Plan. Grindstaff replied that the Findings in the Water Quality chapter had been challenged during internal reviews, and it was decided to not release the chapter until the Findings were further developed.

It was then discussed that the second staff draft of the Delta Plan would contain those chapters currently not included in the first staff draft. Additional discussion centered on the lack of information contained within the first staff draft of the Delta Plan and that preparation of the Findings and their corresponding Fact Sheets would be critical to demonstrate that the “best available science” was used. Norgaard asked if the Fact Sheets would include contrary references. Grindstaff said he would like the Delta ISB to critique the Findings and Fact Sheets in the same manner as was done by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) with respect to the degree of certainty associated with each. Grindstaff agreed to provide a sample of the Fact Sheets to the Delta ISB so that they might have a better idea of what to expect.

Unsolicited Public Comment was provided by:

Valerie Kincaid, San Joaquin River Group Authority who felt that the level of uncertainty of the science used also needs to be disclosed in either the Fact Sheets or the Delta Plan.

Chair Norgaard then requested that the public hold their comments until requested in accordance with the agenda.

3. Lead Scientist Report

The Lead Scientist report was presented by Dr. Cliff Dahm, Lead Scientist for the Delta Science Program. Items he discussed included:

- The Delta Science Program is preparing the chapter on adaptive management for the Delta Plan, which will be Chapter 4: Science and Adaptive Management for a Changing Delta. Chapter 4 will be added to the second staff draft of the Delta Plan scheduled to be posted online on March 17, 2011. Dahm stated that if Council staff approve, Delta Science Program staff would provide this chapter to the Delta ISB for review prior to its release via the second staff draft. Meyer asked if Findings would be included in Chapter 4. Dahm and Hastings responded that the chapter does not lend itself to the development of Findings, but if the Delta ISB thinks Findings should be included, to let Dahm and Hastings know.
- The Council’s February meeting is Feb. 24-25, with both the Lead Scientist report by Dahm and the Delta ISB Chair Report by Norgaard taking place on Feb. 25. Dahm’s

presentation will be focused on informing the Council about the 2010 Proposal Solicitation Process (PSP) and the 13 proposals that have been selected by the PSP selection panel for funding. Norgaard will present a report regarding the outcomes of the Delta ISB's February 18 meeting.

- During the Council's February 24 meeting there will be a presentation by the EPA, which may be of interest to some members of the Delta ISB.
- Beginning in March 2011, the Council will expand its meeting schedule to include workshops on the second Thursday and Friday of each month in addition to its regularly scheduled meetings (the fourth Thursday and Friday of each month). The additional meetings will predominantly be focused on issues related to the Delta Plan. For example, on March 10-11, the public meeting will be a workshop featuring various panels discussing the first staff draft of the Delta Plan.

Subsequent discussion between members of the Delta ISB and Dahm focused on the Fact Sheets that had been discussed earlier by Grindstaff. Dahm explained that he favors the approach used by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) showing degrees of certainty. He also indicated that performance measures, evaluation, and metrics, are important issues that the Delta ISB should comment on.

4. Discussion: Delta Plan Review and Schedule

Chair Norgaard opened this discussion item about whether or not they should meet March 3rd as planned previously. It was decided by all the members of the Delta ISB that they should meet on those dates. The ensuing discussion focused on determining the extent of the Delta ISB's review of the first staff draft. The Delta ISB agreed that although the first staff draft is highly incomplete, that they should provide comments in order to potentially influence future drafts. Each member volunteered to be a lead and/or work on specific chapters of the first staff draft as follows:

Brian F. Atwater	Lead: Chapter 8 and Assist: Chapter 5
Elizabeth A. Canuel	Assist: Chapter 1, 2, 3, 7, and 9
Tracy K. Collier	Lead: Chapter 7 and Assist: Chapter 6
Michael Healey	Lead: Chapter 4
Edward D. Houde	Assist: Chapter 6
Judy Meyer	Co-Lead: Chapter 6
Jeffrey F. Mount	Lead: Chapter 5 and Assist: Chapter 8
Richard B. Norgaard	Lead: Chapter 1, 2, 3, and 9

Delta Independent Science Board Meeting: Teleconference
February 18, 2011

Vincent Resh	Co-Lead: Chapter 6
John A. Wiens	Assist: Chapter 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, and 9

The Delta ISB also agreed to the draft schedule for preparing comments that was proposed by Delta Science Program staff as follows:

Draft schedule for the review of the first staff draft of the Delta Plan by the Delta ISB:

ACTIVITY	WHO	DATE
Discuss First Draft	Delta ISB	March 3
Prepare Draft Review Comments	Delta ISB	March 4
Post on website – teleconference meeting notice and agenda	Science Program Staff	March 4
Finalize Draft Review Comments	Dick and Mike	March 8
Submit to Delta Science Program staff	Dick	March 8
Post draft comment letter on website	Science Program Staff	March 10
Delta ISB Teleconference to approve draft comments	Delta ISB	March 16 or 17
Prepare Final Review Comment Letter/Submit to Delta Science Program Staff	Dick and Mike	March 21 – 10:00 am
Post Final Review Comment Letter	Science Program Staff	March 23
Present Letter at Delta Stewardship Council Meeting	Dick	March 25

5. Public Comment (For matters that were not on the agenda, but within subject matter jurisdiction of the Delta ISB.)

Chair Norgaard provided the public the opportunity to comment, and no comments were made.

6. Preparation for the next Delta ISB meeting

It was determined that a teleconference be scheduled on either March 16 or 17 in order to finalize the Delta ISB's comments on the first staff draft of the Delta Plan. Science Program staff agreed to send out a poll regarding the best date and time. The Delta ISB also began discussion of the April 7-8 meeting and determined that they would focus on those chapters in the second staff draft that were not included in the first staff draft of the Delta Plan.

The meeting concluded at 10:30 a.m., PST.